

Supply of Automotive Diesel Fuel - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation

Result of the fuel tender evaluation.

Tenders were received from five different fuel suppliers and were evaluated against specification, price, certainty of supply, delivery requirements and environmental policies

Based on the outcome of this evaluation process, and subject to the EU requirement for a ten day stand still period, it is recommended that we award the tender for the supply of Diesel fuel to Halls Fuels Limited.

Supply of Automotive Diesel Fuel - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation.

| SCORING MATRIX FOR Hall Fuels | | | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------|
| | Maximum Points Available | Non Compliance (Comment) | Compliance | Actual Points Scored |
| General Requirements | | | | |
| Insolvent bankrupt | | | None - Questionnaire | |
| Questionnaire completed | 2 | Remove supplier | Completed | 2 |
| Public Liability insurance cover | 2 | | Current Certificates | 2 |
| ISO 14001 :2004 | 2 | | Certification included | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| Specification (Quality) | | | | |
| Typical properties - ZSD | 25 | | Typical property ranges | 25 |
| Bunkered supplies - temperature? | 15 | | Bunkered supplies | 15 |
| | Sub-total points = 40 | | | Sub-total points = 40 |
| Price | | | | |
| Platts Mid CIF NW Europe used | 5 | | Yes | 5 |
| Pricing formula & CF (l/t) supplied | 5 | | Not supplied | 5 |
| Premium add-on (ppt) | 15 | | 1.9 ppt | 15 |
| Historical data supplied | 5 | | Two years | 5 |
| Surcharge small loads | 5 | | None stated | 5 |
| Discount - prompt payment | 5 | | None stated | 0 |
| Period of Fixed price | 5 | | 4 Years | 5 |
| Comparative Price above Mid CIF | 10 | | Tied with BWOC | 6 |
| | Sub-total points = 55 | | | Sub-total points = 46 |
| Certainty of Supplies | | | | |
| Accounts submitted | 2 | | Yes, 3 years plus current | 2 |
| Bankers details/reference supplied | 2 | | Yes, reference supplied | 2 |
| Where is diesel fuel supply made? | 2 | | Fawley, Southampton | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| Delivery Conditions | | | | |
| Delivery within 7 days? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| Delivery between 09.00 & 12.00 hrs? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| Separate Invoice/load delivered? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| Environment | | | | |
| Environmental Policy | 2 | | Statement included | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 2 | | | Sub-total points = 2 |
| | Total Points = 115 | | | Total Points = 106 |

Supply of Automotive Diesel Fuel - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation.

| SCORING MATRIX FOR BWOC | | | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------|
| | Maximum Points Available | Non Compliance <i>(Comment)</i> | Compliance | Actual Points Scored |
| <u>General Requirements</u> | | | | |
| Insolvent bankrupt | | Remove supplier | None - Questionnaire | |
| Questionnaire completed | 2 | | Completed | 2 |
| Public Liability Insurance cover | 2 | | Current Certificates | 2 |
| ISO 14001 :2004 | 2 | | Certification included | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| <u>Specification (Quality)</u> | | | | |
| Typical properties - ZSD | 25 | | Typical property ranges | 25 |
| Bunkered supplies - temperature? | 15 | | Bunkered supplies | 15 |
| | Sub-total points = 40 | | | Sub-total points = 40 |
| <u>Price</u> | | | | |
| Platts Mid CIF NW Europe used | 5 | | Yes | 5 |
| Pricing formula & CF (l/t) supplied | 5 | | Yes | 5 |
| Premium add-on (ppt) | 15 | | 1.9ppt | 15 |
| Historical data supplied | 5 | | Not supplied | 0 |
| Surcharge small loads | 5 | | No | 5 |
| Discount - prompt payment | 5 | | No | 0 |
| Period of Fixed price | 5 | | 4 Years | 5 |
| Comparative Price above Mid CIF | 10 | | Second tied with Hall | 6 |
| | Sub-total points = 55 | | | Sub-total points = 41 |
| <u>Certainty of Supplies</u> | | | | |
| Accounts submitted | 2 | | Yes, 3 years plus current | 2 |
| Bankers details/reference supplied | 2 | | Yes, reference supplied | 2 |
| Where is diesel fuel supply made? | 2 | | Various | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| <u>Delivery Conditions</u> | | | | |
| Delivery within 7 days? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| Delivery between 09.00 & 12.00 hrs? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| Separate Invoice/load delivered? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| <u>Environment</u> | | | | |
| Environmental Policy | 2 | | Statement included | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 2 | | | Sub-total points = 2 |
| | Total Points = 115 | | | Total Points = 101 |

Supply of Automotive Diesel Fuel - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation.

| SCORING MATRIX FOR Harvest Energy | | | | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|---|---|----------------------|------------------------------|
| | Maximum Points Available | Non Compliance <i>(Comment)</i> | Compliance | Actual Points Scored | |
| General Requirements | | | | | |
| Insolvent bankrupt | | | None - Questionnaire | | |
| Questionnaire completed | 2 | Remove supplier | Completed | | 2 |
| Public Liability Insurance cover | 2 | | Current Certificates | | 2 |
| ISO 14001 :2004 | 2 | | Certification included | | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| Specification (Quality) | | | | | |
| Typical properties - ZSD | 25 | | Typical property ranges | | 25 |
| Bunkered supplies - temperature? | 15 | | Bunkered supplies | | 15 |
| | Sub-total points = 40 | | | | Sub-total points = 40 |
| Price | | | | | |
| Platts Mid CIF NW Europe used | 5 | | Yes | | 5 |
| Pricing formula & CF (lit) supplied | 5 | | Not supplied | | 5 |
| | | Non-compliant delivery size and Company will not honour this price for specified delivery size. | 1. 19ppl but based on loads in excess of 36000 litres | | |
| Premium add-on (ppl) | 15 | | 4 years | | 0 |
| Historical data supplied | 5 | | Yes | | 5 |
| Surcharge small loads | 5 | | None stated | | 0 |
| Discount - prompt payment | 5 | | 4 Years | | 5 |
| Period of Fixed price | 5 | | Cheapest | | 10 |
| Comparative Price above Mid CIF | 10 | | | | 10 |
| | Sub-total points = 55 | | | | Sub-total points = 30 |
| Certainty of Supplies | | | | | |
| Accounts submitted | 2 | | Yes, 3 years plus current | | 2 |
| Bankers details/reference supplied | 2 | | Yes, reference supplied | | 2 |
| Where is diesel fuel supply made? | 2 | | Fawley, Southampton | | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| Delivery Conditions | | | | | |
| Delivery within 7 days? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | | 2 |
| Delivery between 09.00 & 12.00 hrs? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | | 2 |
| Separate Invoice/load delivered? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| Environment | | | | | |
| Environmental Policy | 2 | | Statement included | | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 2 | | | | Sub-total points = 2 |
| | Total Points = 115 | | | | Total Points = 90 |

Supply of Automotive Diesel Fuel - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation.

SCORING MATRIX FOR CERTAS

| | Maximum Points Available | Non Compliance <i>(Comment)</i> | Compliance | Actual Points Scored |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------------|
| <u>General Requirements</u> | | | | |
| Insolvent bankrupt | | | None - Questionnaire Completed | 2 |
| Questionnaire completed | 2 | Remove supplier | Current Certificates | 2 |
| Public Liability Insurance cover | 2 | | Certification included | 2 |
| ISO 14001 :2004 | 2 | | | |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| <u>Specification (Quality)</u> | | | | |
| Typical properties - ZSD | 25 | | Typical property ranges | 25 |
| Bunkered supplies - temperature? | 15 | | Bunkered supplies | 15 |
| | Sub-total points = 40 | | | Sub-total points = 40 |
| <u>Price</u> | | | | |
| Platts Mid CIF NW Europe used | 5 | | Yes | 5 |
| Pricing formula & CF (If) supplied | 5 | | Not supplied | 5 |
| Premium add-on (ppt) | 15 | | 2.2 ppt | 10 |
| Historical data supplied | 5 | | No | 0 |
| Surcharge small loads | 5 | | Yes | 0 |
| Discount - prompt payment | 5 | | No | 0 |
| Period of Fixed price | 5 | | 4 Years | 5 |
| Comparative Price above Mid CIF | 10 | | Second most Expensive | 3 |
| | Sub-total points = 55 | | | Sub-total points = 28 |
| <u>Certainty of Supplies</u> | | | | |
| Accounts submitted | 2 | | Yes, 3 years plus current | 2 |
| Bankers details/reference supplied | 2 | | Yes, reference supplied | 2 |
| Where is diesel fuel supply made? | 2 | | Fawley, Southampton | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| <u>Delivery Conditions</u> | | | | |
| Delivery within 7 days? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| Delivery between 09.00 & 12.00 hrs? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| Separate Invoice/load delivered? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | Sub-total points = 6 |
| <u>Environment</u> | | | | |
| Environmental Policy | 2 | | Statement included | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 2 | | | Sub-total points = 2 |
| | Total Points = 115 | | | Total Points = 88 |

Supply of Automotive Diesel Fuel - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation.

SCORING MATRIX FOR New Era

| | Maximum Points Available | Non Compliance (Comment) | Compliance | Actual Points Scored |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|
| General Requirements | | | | |
| Insolvent bankrupt | | | None - Questionnaire | 1 |
| Questionnaire completed | 2 | Remove supplier | Partially Completed | 1 |
| Public Liability Insurance cover | 2 | | Current Certificates | 0 |
| ISO 14001 :2004 | 2 | | No | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | |
| Specification (Quality) | | | | |
| Typical properties - ZSD | 25 | | Typical property ranges | 25 |
| Bunkered supplies - temperature? | 15 | | Bunkered supplies | 15 |
| | Sub-total points = 40 | | | |
| Price | | | | |
| Platts Mid CIF NW Europe used | 5 | | Yes | 5 |
| Pricing formula & CF (l/t) supplied | 5 | | Yes | 5 |
| Premium add-on (ppt) | 15 | | 6ppt | 5 |
| Historical data supplied | 5 | | Not supplied | 0 |
| Surcharge small loads | 5 | | Not stated | 0 |
| Discount - prompt payment | 5 | | Yes | 5 |
| Period of Fixed price | 5 | | 4 Years | 5 |
| Comparative Price above Mid CIF | 10 | | Most Expensive | 0 |
| | Sub-total points = 55 | | | |
| Certainty of Supplies | | | | |
| Accounts submitted | 2 | | Partial | 1 |
| Bankers details/reference supplied | 2 | | Yes | 2 |
| Where is diesel fuel supply made? | 2 | | Esso Purfleet | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | |
| Delivery Conditions | | | | |
| Delivery within 7 days? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| Delivery between 09.00 & 12.00 hrs? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| Separate Invoice/load delivered? | 2 | | Contract Requirement | 2 |
| | Sub-total points = 6 | | | |
| Environment | | | | |
| Environmental Policy | 2 | | None | 0 |
| | Sub-total points = 2 | | | |
| | Total Points = 115 | | | Total Points = 78 |

Supply of Automotive Diesel Fuel - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation

| Suppliers Name: | Halls Fuels a Division of Watson Petroleum | BWOC LIMITED | Harvest Energy Limited | Certas Energy UK Limited | New Era Fuels Ltd |
|---|--|---|--|--|--|
| Tender Requirements | Birkweth, Chippenham, Wiltshire SN15 5DN 01794-248659 | BWOC LTD, BW ESTATE, OLDMIKTON CRECENT, WESTON-SUPER-MARE, BS248BA | York House, 45 Seymour Street, London, W1H7JT | Certas Energy UK Limited, The Astra One, 307 Bridgewater Place, Bridewood Park, Warrington, Cheshire, W939EG | Essex House, The Astra Centre, Harlow, Essex, CM202BN |
| General Requirements | | | | | |
| Questionnaire completed? | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Partial |
| Form of Tender signed by authorised party? | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Anti-collision Certificate signed? | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Public Liability Insurance for £10,000,000? | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Claims under Firm's Professional Indemnity? | No | No | No | No | No |
| Specification (Quality) | | | | | |
| Typical Properties - EN590 Diesel | | | | | |
| Sulphur (ISO20848) 10 ppm | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Density (IP363) 840 kg/m ³ | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Cetane number (ISO5165) 55 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Cetane Index (ISO4264) 53 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Lubricity (ISO12156-1) 400 microns | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Viscosity (IP71) 3.0 cSt | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Measured from bunkered supplies at ambient temperature. | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Price | | | | | |
| Platts EN590, 2004 NW Europe Mt CIF | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Pricing formula used included? | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Details of Historic Pricing Fluctuations? | No | No | Yes | Yes | No |
| Litres/tonne conversion rate? (CF) | Not stated | No | Yes | Yes | No |
| FT daily exchange rate? | Not stated | No | No | No | No |
| Tender price per Litre Mt - CIF +? Pence Per Litre | Mt CIF +1.9 PENCE PER LITRE | Mt CIF +1.9 PENCE PER LITRE | Yes Mt CIF + 1.9 pence per litre (pl for 30,000 litre load) | Mid CIF + 2.2 pence per litre | Mid CIF + 6 pence per litre |
| Additional cost for small load - ppl surcharge | Not stated | No | Yes | Yes | Not Stated |
| Delivery included? | Not stated | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Payment terms? | Not stated | No | 30 days | 30 days | 30 days |
| For what period the tender price is fixed for? | 2015 to February 2019 | 2015 to February 2019 | 2015 to February 2019 | 2015 to February 2019 | 2015 to February 2019 |
| Formula basis for any price increase? | Not stated | Not stated | Not stated | Not stated | Not stated |
| Early payment discount? | Not stated | Not stated | Yes | Not stated | Yes 3ppol if paid within 7 days |
| Certainty of Supplies | | | | | |
| Financial standing - Company Accounts given? | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Bankers reference permitted/letter supplied? | Yes | No (cash supply bank) | Yes | No | Yes |
| - Any Bankruptcy? | None recorded | No | No | Company changed names from GB Fuels in 2013 | No |
| Guarantee by Parent Company offered? | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | N/A |
| Experiences - Company history? Co. Group? | Company reg. 2011/57 no. 594001 - No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Esso Purified |
| Where Diesel fuel made? | Fawley Refinery, Southampton | Co mingled | VOPAK West Thurrock | Yes | |
| Delivery Conditions | | | | | |
| Within 7 days of order? | Not stated | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Delivery between 9.00 and 12.00 hrs? | Not stated | Yes | 06:30 and 12:30 | Yes | Yes |
| Small Load Premium? | Not stated | No | Yes unable to sign-off the submitted price | Yes | Not Stated |
| Separate invoice sent per load delivered? | Not stated | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |

Automotive Diesel Fuel Supply - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation - October 2010

| Company: Halls Fuels - a Division of Watson Petroleum | | | | | | |
|---|------------|--------------|------------------------|-------------|----------------|--------------|
| Evaluation Criteria | Weighting | Maximum Mark | Maximum Weighted Score | Actual Mark | Weighted score | Convert to % |
| Most Economically Advantageous Tender | | | | | | |
| (i) Specification compliance and quality merit | 40 | 40 | 1600 | 40 | 1600 | 100 |
| (ii) Price | 40 | 55 | 2200 | 46 | 1440 | 83.64 |
| (iii) Certainty of supplies | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| (iv) Delivery conditions | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| (v) Relevant environmental characteristics | 5 | 2 | 10 | 2 | 10 | 100 |
| (vi) Qualification Questionnaire response | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| | 100 | 116 | 3900 | 106 | 3640 | 90.77 |
| Company: BWOC LIMITED | | | | | | |
| Evaluation Criteria | Weighting | Maximum Mark | Maximum Weighted Score | Actual Mark | Weighted score | Convert to % |
| Most Economically Advantageous Tender | | | | | | |
| (i) Specification compliance and quality merit | 40 | 40 | 1600 | 40 | 1600 | 100 |
| (ii) Price | 40 | 55 | 2200 | 41 | 1640 | 74.55 |
| (iii) Certainty of supplies | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| (iv) Delivery conditions | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| (v) Relevant environmental characteristics | 5 | 2 | 10 | 2 | 10 | 100 |
| (vi) Qualification Questionnaire response | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| | 100 | 116 | 3900 | 101 | 3340 | 86.84 |
| Company: Harvest Energy Limited | | | | | | |
| Evaluation Criteria | Weighting | Maximum Mark | Maximum Weighted Score | Actual Mark | Weighted score | Convert to % |
| Most Economically Advantageous Tender | | | | | | |
| (i) Specification compliance and quality merit | 40 | 40 | 1600 | 40 | 1600 | 100 |
| (ii) Price | 40 | 55 | 2200 | 30 | 1200 | 54.55 |
| (iii) Certainty of supplies | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| (iv) Delivery conditions | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| (v) Relevant environmental characteristics | 5 | 2 | 10 | 2 | 10 | 100 |
| (vi) Qualification Questionnaire response | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| | 100 | 116 | 3900 | 90 | 2900 | 74.36 |
| Company: Certas Energy UK Limited | | | | | | |
| Evaluation Criteria | Weighting | Maximum Mark | Maximum Weighted Score | Actual Mark | Weighted score | Convert to % |
| Most Economically Advantageous Tender | | | | | | |
| (i) Specification compliance and quality merit | 40 | 40 | 1600 | 40 | 1600 | 100 |
| (ii) Price | 40 | 55 | 2200 | 28 | 1120 | 50.91 |
| (iii) Certainty of supplies | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| (iv) Delivery conditions | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| (v) Relevant environmental characteristics | 5 | 2 | 10 | 2 | 10 | 100 |
| (vi) Qualification Questionnaire response | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| | 100 | 116 | 3900 | 88 | 2820 | 72.31 |
| Company: New Era Fuels Ltd | | | | | | |
| Evaluation Criteria | Weighting | Maximum Mark | Maximum Weighted Score | Actual Mark | Weighted score | Convert to % |
| Most Economically Advantageous Tender | | | | | | |
| (i) Specification compliance and quality merit | 40 | 40 | 1600 | 40 | 1600 | 100 |
| (ii) Price | 40 | 55 | 2200 | 25 | 1000 | 45.45 |
| (iii) Certainty of supplies | 5 | 6 | 30 | 5 | 25 | 83.33 |
| (iv) Delivery conditions | 5 | 6 | 30 | 6 | 30 | 100 |
| (v) Relevant environmental characteristics | 5 | 2 | 10 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| (vi) Qualification Questionnaire response | 5 | 6 | 30 | 2 | 10 | 33.33 |
| | 100 | 116 | 3900 | 78 | 2655 | 68.33 |